

***Historical Commission  
Minutes***

City of Foley Council  
Chambers 407 E. Laurel Ave.  
Foley, Alabama

**September 8, 2020**

**1:00 p.m.**

Due to COVID-19 we will accept email comments ([mringler@cityoffoley.org](mailto:mringler@cityoffoley.org) or [acole@cityoffoley.org](mailto:acole@cityoffoley.org)). Or you may call 952-4011 and Melissa or Amanda can take your verbal comments. These will be entered into the meeting minutes. The HC members will be conducting the meeting via teleconferencing. If you wish to participate in this manner dial 1-401-542-3236 PIN 781 260 503. If you choose to attend the meeting please follow social distancing rules.

**I. Call to order 1:10**

Chairman Shanks called the meeting to order at 1:10 p.m.

**II. Roll call**

Members present were: Justin Shanks, Kathy LeDrew, Randy Arp and JaNay Dawson. Jack Purser and Donna Turbyfill attended via teleconference. Absent member was Kerry Slota. Staff present were: Miriam Boone, City Planner; Chuck Lay, Chief Building Inspector; Connie Hughes, Building Inspector and Melissa Ringler, Recording Secretary. Amanda Cole, Planning and Zoning Assistant attended via teleconference.

**III. Approval of Minutes**

- Approve May 12, 2020 minutes as published

Commissioner Purser made a motion to approve the May 12, 2020 meeting minutes. Vice Chairman LeDrew seconded the motion. All Commissioners voted aye.

**Motion to approve the May 12, 2020 meeting minutes passes.**

**IV. Staff Approval**

- La Trinidad, Leasee-Christian Bernal  
106 N Alston St  
National District-Contributing
  - a. Request to install exterior signage

Mr. Chuck Lay stated a staff approval was done for the La Trinidad signage. He stated the sign is a logo and is not violating any of the guidelines.

**V. New Business**

- Foley Main Street  
109 S McKenzie St-Side of Building  
National Register-Non Contributing
  - a. Request Wall Mural

Mrs. Darrelyn Dunmore explained they are requesting to paint a mural on an already painted building. She explained the mural will be of a butterfly with images that are familiar in Foley interwoven into the design. She stated the drawing is still a rough draft and there will be much more detail in the finished product. She explained there will be space in between the wings for photo ops. Tables, pavers and a butterfly garden will be added to the area.

Commissioner Dawson asked where the pavers would be located.

Mrs. Dunmore stated the pavers will be placed below the mural for people to stand on while taking pictures.

Vice Chairman LeDrew made a motion to approve the request certificate of appropriateness. Commissioner Dawson seconded the motion. All Commissioners voted aye.

**Motion to approve the requested certificate of appropriateness passes.**

- Our Coffee  
Joanna Mayes  
358 N Alston St.  
National District- Contributing
  - a. Request for building remodel

Mr. Lay explained the previous submission has been withdrawn and the request is a resubmittal.

Commissioner Dawson stated a letter sent by Mr. Stephen McNair stated the building is non-contributing.

Mr. Stephen McNair explained there was an error in the letter. His firm recommended the building be non-contributing in the original survey. He stated the recommendation was changed by the State. He explained the smaller one story portion of the building with dormers is classified as contributing and the rest of the building as being non-contributing. He stated the only thing that is contributing to the building is the exterior stone. He explained the vinyl siding, windows and dormers are not original. The question is what can be changed and should it be changed. He stated the building can be touched and changed. There is one window that will be removed and expanded for a door opening which will require a small portion of the stone cladding to be removed. He stated the question is would that compromise the building enough to remove it from the registry and the answer is no. Should it be done is up to the Historical Commission to decide. He stated the front entry elements and other things that are being added could easily be removed.

Chairman Shanks stated it looks like a lot of the materials are being matched with similar style and this would improve the building cosmetically.

Mr. McNair stated it will be an improvement.

Mr. Sted McCollough stated the request is to replace all exterior vinyl windows with aluminum clad windows, remove a window to add a glass door, extending the existing brick entry gable wall element to form a parapet wall which includes cutting back the large overhangs on the entry roof element, add roof flashing to prevent leakage, removal of vinyl siding to be replaced with painted hardie board lap siding, removal and replacement of all exterior doors and windows, and new metal stairs on the east side of the building.

Mr. McNair stated the aluminum clad windows are not only approved but are a recommended

replacement.

Commissioner Dawson stated if the building is contributing and we allow major changes on all our buildings how much of a historical district will we have left.

Chairman Shanks stated the building has been heavily modified with the vinyl siding and windows. He stated he feels the proposed changes would make the building a little more historically appropriate.

Commissioner Purser stated he doesn't want the Commission to seem arbitrary and capricious.

Mr. McNair stated each application should be reviewed on a case by case basis. He explained just because you approve something today doesn't open the door because the Commission has the keys to the door. He explained the guidelines are set up for each application.

Commissioner Dawson asked if it is going to give the perception the Commission is being arbitrary and capricious if the request is approved. She stated the Commission does not want to compromise the guidelines from top to bottom which is what it looks like they would be doing.

Mr. McNair stated the guidelines do not prevent the changes. He explained the guidelines say if the Commission is comfortable with the minor changes they may approve the request. He stated if they were removing all of the stone it would be a different case but he doesn't feel like removing a few feet will affect the classification of the building.

Commissioner Arp asked if they would be keeping the same header block.

Mr. McCollough answered yes the same header block would be used. He stated the bottom portion and sides of the existing window area will be removed which is stone.

Commissioner Dawson stated the Commission does not want to be perceived as anti-business or uncooperative. She explained it is certainly better to have the building occupied than vacant. She stated the Commission's job is to protect the older and historical buildings and the Commission has to decide where the two situations meet in the middle.

Chairman Shanks stated he feels there are valid concerns regarding not being perceived as arbitrary. He stated it is the Commission's job to interpret each individual application. He explained he hopes the Commission isn't presented as being purely binary in that regard. He stated the Commission has to interpret the guidelines and there are still compliance checks that have to be done.

Vice Chairman LeDrew stated the addition of the door opening doesn't bother her as much as the entry being cut back over the front door. She explained the entryway has been as it exists today since she has been in Foley.

Mr. McCollough stated there will be a portion cutback approximately 2' on each side. He explained he does not think that element is a contributing portion of the building. He stated his understanding is the only historical element is the dimple stone. He explained having the new door will make a huge difference and the entry element will look better attached to the building rather than a structure being built unattached in front of the building.

Mr. McNair stated the language in the survey only addresses the stone which came from a Baldwin County manufacturer. He explained in his opinion the stone is the only thing that made the building contributing.

Chairman Shanks stated the proposed changes seem like they would make the building more cosmetically towards a historical status.

Commissioner Dawson stated she doesn't feel like the building will ever regain its status after the proposed changes.

Chairman Shanks made a motion to approve the requested certificate of appropriateness. Commission Turbyfill seconded the motion. Commissioner Dawson voted aye. Commissioner Arp abstained. Vice Chairman LeDrew and Commissioner Purser voted nay.

**Motion to approve the requested certificate of appropriateness passes.**

- Frances Holk Jones-Owner  
105,107 & 109 S Alston St and  
113,115,117,119 and 121 W Laurel Ave  
National District-Contributing
  - a. Request to repair, repaint and add awnings to exterior of building

Mrs. Frances Holk Jones stated she is representing Mr. Arthur Holk. She thanked Mainstreet and Mr. McCollough for their assistance with the application. She explained she has had discussions with the City and they have expressed they would like to improve the alley ways. She stated the work would include re-patching and painting the already painted brick, repainting all window trim and cast stone with a stucco color paint, pressure washing, replacing and painting doors, adding fabric awnings.

Commissioner Dawson asked if all the repainting will be on brick that was previously painted.

Mrs. Holk Jones answered yes.

Commissioner Arp stated some of the new alley doors have glass panes. He stated the new doors and the awnings will be a way to dress up the alley. He asked if the applicant should apply for the grant multiple times on multiple applications rather than one. He stated they could possibly get \$5,000 for each tenant.

Mr. Charlie Ebert stated there was a change in the language of the façade grant regarding approval per address or building.

Mr. Mike Thompson stated Council will have to make the determination on issuing based by multi-tenant buildings or single owner applications. He stated we have not had any request that have been for multiple tenant spaces owned by the same owner. He stated Council may want to put a limit on the grant amount but those are questions the Council and City will have to work through.

Mr. Ebert stated he would recommend not delaying the work and moving forward and letting Council work out the details.

Mr. Thompson stated one negative for breaking the application up is you would have a hard time getting quotes for doing only a portion of the work.

Mrs. Holk Jones stated tenants usually do not make improvements to the alley or awnings since it does not benefit them but it does benefit the City.

Mrs. Dunmore stated it was her decision to do one application with all the addresses attached rather than doing multiple applications.

Mr. Lay stated he and Mr. Ebert will have to inspect the work upon completion and will need to know how to handle it and if there are any changes.

Commissioner Arp made a motion to approve the requested certificate of appropriateness. Vice Chairman LeDrew seconded the motion. All Commissioners voted aye.

**Motion to approve the requested certificate of appropriateness passes.**

**VI. Grant Recommendation**

- Frances Holk Jones-Owner  
105,107 & 109 S Alston St and  
113,115,117,119 and 121 W Laurel Ave  
National District-Contributing

Commissioner Arp made a motion to recommend the grant to Mayor and Council. Commissioner Dawson seconded the motion. All Commissioners voted aye.

**Motion to recommend the grant to Mayor and Council passes.**

**VII. Discussion**

There were no discussion items.

**VIII. Adjournment**

Chairman Shanks adjourned the meeting at 2:07 p.m.